Eötvös Loránd University of Arts and Sciences
Faculty of Humanities

Dissertation Abstract

Ágnes Kuna

Patterns of persuasion in Hungarian medical recipe from the 16th-17th century
– functional cognitive analysis –

Doctoral School in Linguistics
Head of Doctoral School: Dr. Gábor Tolcsvai Nagy MHAS

Cultural Linguistics Programme
Head of Doctoral Programme: Dr. Zoltán Kövecses DSc

Members of the Dissertation Committee:

Chair: Dr. Zoltán Kövecses DSc

Officially invited reviewers:
Dr. Krisztina Laczkó PhD
Dr. Anita Schirm PhD

Committee secretary:
Dr. Nóra Kugler PhD

Committee members:
Dr. Csilla Dér PhD
Dr. Szilárd Tátrai PhD
Dr. Veronika Szelid PhD

Dissertation supervisor: Dr. Rita Brdar-Szabó PhD

2015
„Persuasion is such an integral part of human interaction, that learning to understand it better will always be meaningful. Learning more about persuasion, we believe, is learning more about human nature”
(Virtanen–Halmari: 2005: 4)

1. The assignment of the topic, the validity of the topic
Healing has always represented an activity valuable for the community, an integral part of spiritual culture, which is proven by the numerous medical records which survived through different ages and cultures. Curing is to a large extent defined by the scientific views attached to it, as well as the dominant religious beliefs and the connected institutions, all in all, the sociocultural background of curing. We can observe that the healing process always have a relational aspect. The relationship between a patient and healer is basically influenced by the willingness to help, trust, focusing; which means a certain positive attitude, in the expression of which language plays a decisive role. The individual rites, therapeutic procedures and treatments are complemented by the spoken word, the healing, supporting and strengthening performed by communication. This is observable throughout the whole history of curing, therefore the presence of the healing relationship can be viewed as a process. If we only consider some states within the Hungarian traditions: it can be traced in the healing traditions of shamans, medieval monks, folk healers and later in the practice of medically trained doctors as well.

The present thesis has twofold aims: 1) The main aim is to explore the healing relationship, in a narrower sense the linguistic patterns of persuasive intent and positive communication in the earliest written period of medical literature in Hungarian language, in the 16th-17th centuries. The frame of reference is supplied by the medical recipe as the actual genre. The reason for this is that the recipe in the 16th-17th centuries is one of the commonest genre; fulfilling a central role in both every day and more scientific healing; moreover it is present at all levels of the medical text tradition. Therefore it serves as an applicable frame for investigating persuasive communication (cf. Halmari–Virtanen 2005: 2). Another aim of the thesis is to provide foundation and explication of the theoretical framework of the empirical study in a cognitive approach. Therefore, it aims at introducing and modeling persuasion and its strategies on the basis of the social-cognitive bases of human communication.

The starting point of the present study is on the one hand that persuasion can be understood and described by the general cognitive principles of communication. On the other hand it investigates how the power of word and suggestion plays an important role in both folk- and scientific healing, and how it is represented linguistically in the texts related to healing. The formation of these representations is closely related to the evolved patterns of medical text traditions (genres, style types), the relations expressed towards them (norm, style), as well as the social and cultural factors of healing (cf. Kuna 2012, Tolcsvai Nagy 2012). Consequently, positive communication and persuasive intent can only be analysed and interpreted relying on these in the different ages. The theoretical background of the investigation, the functional cognitive approach to language allows for the inclusion of these factors, which principles will be followed in both the theoretical foundation and the empirical analysis.
In the followings I introduce the basic research questions of the thesis, designate and argue for the time limits of the research; in connection with this I introduce the material and the method of the research, then I describe the structure of the thesis, with a short summary of the results.

2. Research questions of the thesis

The thesis, as it is referred to in the title and the above summary aims at a description of persuasion in a cognitive framework, and as is main aim, to provide a linguistic pattern for the description of the persuasive intent and positive communication in 16th-17th century recipes. Already at this point emphasis must be laid on the fact that the analysis meets its boundaries in several respects: 1) First, any research into historical texts is unavoidably restricted, as we only have written documents at our disposal, being entirely by chance what remained for posterity. 2) Second, the texts and the linguistic activity of the age requires a high level of reconstruction. The analysis of the specific functions, speech acts is necessarily limited, is performed from an interpretational horizon of this day and age, moreover, it cannot be tested using empirical methods. 3) Third, the examined speech act itself, its persuasive intent presents difficulties, as persuasion can mostly be approached from the persuasive intent (comp. Jucker 1997). The effects of persuasion can only be examined by using complex, interdisciplinary methods. In this particular case, historicity entirely excludes this possibility. Despite the fact that the careful analysis and inclusion of the contemporary medical writings has been done, still, the linguistic representations and communicative strategies presented as persuasion can only be evaluated as inferences. These limits are considered throughout the whole research, and all my statements are formulated in the full knowledge of them.

Taking these factors into consideration, the thesis tries to find the answers for the following questions:

1. What cognitive principles and strategies are at work in the process of persuasion?
2. How can persuasion be modelled as a speech act?
3. By what conceptual categories can the persuasive sections of 16th-17th century recipes be characterized?
4. Which conceptual categories are used most often and what is the reason for this?
5. What role is fulfilled in the elaboration of persuasive intent by VALUE, and its positive and negative poles?
6. What kind of text-structuring or other pragmatic functions could be fulfilled by the persuasive sections?
7. Can persuasion be treated as a structural unit from the point of view of text typology in early medical recipes?
8. If yes, is it possible to identify a prototype for the persuasive sections of the contemporary recipes?
9. What sort of connection exists between the user-levels of medical discourse frame and the linguistic-conceptual realization of persuasion?
10. What role is played by the norm of the genre in the elaboration of the persuasive intent?
11. Is it possible to detect evolution-historical processes in the examined period?
12. To what extent and by what methods can the question of the persuasive effect be examined?

3. The data and the method of research
The research concentrates on the beginning period of the Hungarian-language recipes’ evolution history: the 16th-17th centuries. The time limits of the research are designated partly by the selected material, partly by other closely related factors (see Kuna 2011). The research into persuasion is based on 22 contemporary manuscripts. The software-based analysis has been performed on 5 carefully selected recipe-collections (Hoffmann 1989) and a medical book, the Ars medica. The linguistic patterns of persuasion were examined in the recipe-collections: 2475 recipes were examined by the analytical tool Atlas.ti 7; while the bulky medical book (1000 folias) was examined in its electronic version, by its own software (Szabó T.–Bíró 2000).

I applied a several-step approach in the empirical part of the research into persuasion. The formulation of persuasion-based conceptual categories (codes) has been performed on different levels. First, on a sample containing 5,000 recipes I examined persuasion as a functionally delineable textual unit (Kuna 2008, Kuna 2011). Already at this stage I made note of the fact that persuasion is present as a text structuring strategy, so I began to observe and categorize the typical conceptual categories of persuasion in recipes. In doing so, I also observed and categorized the linguistic representations linked to persuasive intent and positive communication, also including the related rhetorical-linguistic, psychological and modern age medical communication analyses. The validity of the finished code system was performed by eight psychology MA students on ELTE PPK during the 2013/2014 spring semester conducted by Katalin Varga. After finalising the codes, the qualitative analysis has been performed on five manuscripts selected from the 15 recipe collections with the help of the Atlas.ti 7 software. The software analysis facilitates the introduction of the frequencies and possible overlaps of the code categories as well as the listing of the coded linguistic representations. With the programme Atlas.ti, within the 2745 recipes I used 2912 persuasive quotations and 4170 code markings.

The formulated and validated codes and the software analysis served as basis for the examination of the extensive Ars medica, which I performed with the help of the linguistic representations connected to the codes on the electronic version of the book. (Szabó T.–Bíró 2000). The change in methodology was necessitated by the huge amount of the Ars medica makes it difficult to perform a qualitative analysis with the Atlas.ti-software. Such a document cannot be managed by the program, besides, coding such an amount of material (1000 folias) is huge work. The analysis of the remedy book is only facilitated by using its electronic

---

1 Conceptual category and code are used as synonyms throughout the thesis. Although in linguistics the term code is used in different senses, in this case it is used according to the wording of the qualitative software analysis.
2 Katalin Varga is the associate professor at ELTE PPK Affektive Psychology Department as well as the director of the programme Application of suggestion in somatic medication. I wish to thank her and the students participating in the validation process: Ildikó Belák, Petrá Böör, Alexandra Halász, Marian Hutter, Fanni Ormos, Ágnes Révész, Réka Ruttner, Anna Zély.
3 MBM, TOK, KP, HP, MOR. See Source.
version, and it also has its own search software (Szabó T.–Bíró 2000). The formulation of the codes, and the linguistic representations arising through the examination of the recipe compilations allows us to identify linguistic samples (tokens) in an extensive work, and to collect the linguistic representations related to the conceptual-linguistic category of persuasion. In sum, I collected 3884 text sections or word tokens related to persuasion.

In terms of methodology, the examination of the persuasive intent is performed in a spiral: the linguistic representations arrived at by the qualitative analysis serve as a base for the Ars medica (AM) examination with its own software, which modulates and reflects the qualitative analysis.

4. The structure of the thesis

Following the first introductory chapter I elaborate the theoretical background of the research (2.). In this, a crucial role is played by the theoretical framework underlying the whole thesis, the functional cognitive linguistic view, which I introduce with respect to the applied basic ideas. (2.1.). I especially mention the functional pragmatic approach (2.1.1.) and the role of historicity within (2.1.2., 2.1.3.). As the actual speech act plays a crucial role in the examination of persuasion, I also elaborate the cognitive approach to the genre (2.1.4.). Moreover, the most important cognitive linguistic foundations are also discussed, which play a role in the description of persuasion. (2.1.5., 2.1.6.). The basic terminology, and the general theoretical overview is followed by a cognitive functional approach to persuasion in chapter 2.2., building on the rhetorical tradition and the psychological theories. The chapter clarifies the most important basic terminology in my theoretical framework. I introduce the triad of ethos, logos pathos (2.2.2.), and the interpretation of value and attitude (2.3.). Following this I introduce persuasion as a speech act (2.4.), within this as a typically indirect evaluative representative (2.4.2.). The phenomenon’s explicit-implicit (2.5.) nature is related to a detailed examination of the strategic character of persuasion (2.6.), as well as the general principles of human communication, its strategies with relation to its effectivity: polarisation (2.6.1.), a perspectivization (2.6.2.), intensified (2.6.3.), metaphorization (2.6.4.), positioning (2.6.5.), and the strategy of interpersonal narrowing-distancing (2.6.6.).

Given the theoretical framework of the present thesis, the sociocultural factors play decisive role in the present research, therefore in the 3rd chapter I supply an overview of the characteristics of the contemporary medical tradition, therefore I give an overview of the contemporary medical profession through the characteristics of the 16th-17th centuries medical text tradition in the 3. chapter (3.1.). Moreover I introduce the genre serving as the frame for the investigation, the recipe (3.2.). Following this I give a detailed introduction to the linguistic representations and patterns of persuasive intent in the 16th-17th century recipes in the most extensive 4. chapter. First I give a detailed introduction with numerous examples of the linguistic-conceptual categories (codes) of persuasion in recipes (4.1.), namely: GENERAL POSITIVE VALUE\(^4\) (4.1.1.); INTENSITY (4.1.2.), BEING TESTED (4.1.3.), CERTAINTY (4.1.4.), TIME FACTOR (4.1.5.), the RESULT OF THERAPY (4.1.6.), AUTHORITY (4.1.7.), EMOTIONAL INVOLVEMENT (4.1.8.), REASONING (4.1.9.), besides other cases (4.1.10.). In point 4.1.11. I summarize the codes present in the recipes, besides I also mention how they are interconnected with the strategies

---

\(^4\) Concepts, according to the cognitive linguistic tradition are used in capitals.
of persuasion. Following this I introduce the recipe compilations (4.2.) and the analysed medical book, the *Ars medica*’s (4.3.) persuasive pattern tendencies, after which I compare them (4.3.11.). Finally, I finish the analysis of persuasion in recipes by outlining what sort of possibilities are at hand to gain access to the effectivity (4.4.). Concerning the effectivity I briefly outline the factors of healing process in 16th-17th centuries (4.4.1.), contemporary research into medical communication (4.4.2.), as well as an empirical study concerning the present reception of 16th-17th centuries (4.4.3.). Finally, I conclude the characteristics of persuasive intent (4.4.4.). The thesis is finished with a summarizing chapter (5.), which summarizes the results of the research according to the research topics, introducing future research possibilities. The content section is followed by References and Appendix.

5. The results of the thesis

The research points out that persuasion can be conceptualized and modelled by applying the cognitive linguistic view, and it is possible to interpret it based on cognitive linguistic categories. Persuasion as a speech act, given its implicit and indirect nature, can predominantly interpreted as indirect assertion, with the act of evaluation and its communication play a decisive role. It has been exemplified that persuasion can be described with the speech act scenario model (Panther–Thorburg 1997, 1998), as well as the Croftian speech act theory (Croft 1994). The empirical analysis was mainly based on the metonymical model. The metonymical interpretation is closely related to the implicit and indirect nature of persuasion. The recipes have exemplified that from the genre and healing scenario (as a complex schema) certain elements are activated or co-activated, depending on the informants’ intent (as well as the recipients’ attitude). The elaboration of the persuasive intent and the persuasive effect can be influenced by each element of the schema.

In the analysis of persuasion my starting point was that persuasion is a complex and dynamic process, which can be approached from the point of view of intent and effect; moreover, as all linguistic activity, it is also emphatically context-dependent phenomenon. It does not exist in itself and for itself. Because of its basically implicit nature, the phenomenon’s connection with strategy has central position. Concerning persuasion, I elaborated six strategies, taking into consideration cognition, linguistic processing and social behaviour: polarization, perspectivization, intensification, metaphorization, positioning, and the strategy of interpersonal approaching-distancing. The working of these strategies were tested empirically, in the persuasive sections of recipes. The analysis pointed out on the one hand, that the introduced strategies are often related; on the other hand they can capture persuasion as a process in the examined texts. Still, numerous other genres need to be examined to be able to characterize and underline these strategies in relation to persuasion.

In connection with strategies, I elaborated the ten conceptual-linguistic categories of the persuasive sections of 16th-17th century recipes. These are the followings: in close connection with polarization the POSITIVE VALUE (code 1), the RESULT OF THERAPY (code 6), the EMOTIONAL INVOLVEMENT (code 8); in connection with intensification INTENSITY (code 2), the TIME FACTOR (code 5), as well as REASONING (code 9); in connection with perspectivization BEING TESTED (code 3), CERTAINTY (code 4) and AUTHORITY (code 7). In other categories the PLACE OF HEALING, as well as PRAYING/ENCHANTING (code 10), which can also be brought into connection with intensification. The empirical analysis proved that
these conceptual categories are very often presented in interrelation concerning recipes. The most often worked out categories in interrelation are INTENSITY, POSITIVE VALUE and RESULT OF THERAPY. These in themselves can be viewed as the most often used categories. It is also observable that INTENSITY is almost always related to one of the other codes. The examined corpus exemplifies the dominance of the positive pole in terms of persuasion.

The analysis also shows that the most typical position for persuasion in recipes is at the end of the text. At the same time they can be present at any part of the text, therefore it cannot be viewed as a text unit. Its prototype is characterised with the following: it is either at the end of the text, then it is more closely related to the scenario of healing; in relation with this it has a wider scope (not only in case of certain illnesses); moreover it stand on its own, but it can also be related to other patterns as well. The prototype of persuasion in recipes can mostly be linked to the codes and sub-codes of USEFULNESS, BEING TESTED, GETTING HEALED. Based on the research we can also observe that the prototype cannot be linked to the most often represented categories.

On the basis of the examined manuscripts, the recipe compilations and the remedy books display similar tendencies, which can refer to a similar tendency in the norm of the examined genre concerning the elaboration of persuasion independent of the different levels of medical text tradition. Moreover the results can further be influenced by involving further medical works in the investigation.

The thesis shortly discussed what type of research or methods can be of help in the examination of effect factors in discovering the persuasive patterns in 16th-17th century recipes. In my analysis I pointed out that it is impossible to analyse the actual realizations of the individual texts. At the same time research into medical- and cultural history, as well as modern age doctor-patient communication can all help in reconstruction, allowing for tentative conclusions as well. I also introduced with respect to a short questionnaire survey what sort of principles are at work if we test contemporary texts with today’s recipients.

In summary it can be stated that according to the targets of the present thesis it supplied the description and modelling of persuasion in a cognitive framework. Moreover it also tested the applicability of the model, introduced the most typical conceptual-linguistic categories of persuasive intent and its characteristics in the 16th-17th century recipes. The results of the research: 1) a cognitive description of persuasion can supply a framework for further analyses which show the relation of persuasion and other genres. 2) The similar investigation of further genres facilitates the description and comparison in terms of the individual genres and discourse domains. 3) It also offers a way to compare the persuasive tendencies within the actual genres in their evolvement history. 4) A further interesting possibility is the comparison of the different visual type discourses within the described model. 5) The detailed examination of the persuasive sections of the recipes, the collected linguistic representations and characteristic linguistic patterns, as I have referred to at different parts of the thesis can serve as a base for a more or less automatic annotation of persuasion in the upcoming medical corpus. 6) In line with the cognitive view of language, the analysis also draws attention to the fact that (although with certain limits) speech activity can be viewed as dynamic process in historical perspective as well.
Sources


References


6. Scientific publications and lectures on the topic of the thesis

6.1. Lectures

2015. 04. 22. Semmelweis University, Budapest
A pozitív nyelvi gyakorlat szerepe a gyógyító kapcsolatban – Történeti és jelenkori kitekintés – [Positive language in healing]

2015. 03. 30. 25. MANYE-kongresszus, Budapest
A Magyar orvosi nyelv korpuszának tervezete [Hungarian Medical Corpus] (with Zsófia Ludányi)

2014. 09. 03. 5th International Conference on Critical Approaches to Discourse Analysis across Disciplines, Budapest
Patterns of persuasion in Hungarian medical discourse domain from the 16th and 17th centuries

2014. 02. 05. Socio-cultural factors in style, Budapest
The socio-cultural value of the Hungarian politeness marker “tetszik.” The stylistic function of “tetszik” in doctor-patient communication (with Ágnes Domonkosi)

2013. 06. 06. Kapcsolatunk Világa, A Magyar Pszichológiai Társaság XXII. Országos Tudományos Nagygyűlése, Budapest
Orvos-beteg kommunikáció és az érzelemkifejtés nyelvészeti elemzése a családorvosi gyakorlatban [Emotions in doctor-patient consultation] (with Zsuzsa Kaló)

2013. 04. 06. 3. STAps Interdisziplinäre Perspektiven auf Sprache, Diskurs und Kultur, Heidelberg (Németország)
Kommunikative Muster der partnerorientierten und autoritären Beziehung in der Hausarzt-Praxis

2012. 11. 20. Diskurzusok a szakmai diskurzusról. A tudományok, szakmák nyelvének leírása, Budapest
Orvos-beteg kommunikáció a családorvosi gyakorlatban [Doctor-patient communication in family doctor’s practice] (with Zsuzsa Kaló)

2012. 11. 20. Diskurzusok a szakmai diskurzusról. A tudományok, szakmák nyelvének leírása, Budapest
Betegségkoncepciók a 16–17. századi orvosi receptek meggyőző részeiben [Illness-conceptions in the persuasive sections of medical recipes of the 16th and 17th centuries]

2012. 10. 10. Fünfte Internationale Konferenz der Deutschen Gesellschaft für Kognitive Linguistik, Freiburg (Németország)
Die Anweisung als Sprechakt in ungarischen medizinischen Rezepten im 16-17. Jahrhundert (poszter)

2012. 07. 29. Metaphor Kolloquium IV, Heidelberg (Németország)
Illness-conceptions in the persuasive sections of medical recipes of the 16th and 17th centuries

2012. 04. 21. DAAD-Treffen, Göttingen (Németország); invited speaker
Überzeugungsstrategien in den ungarischen medizinischen Rezepten im 16-17. Jahrhundert

2012. 03. 30. A nyelvtörténeti kutatások újabb eredményei VII., Szeged
Meggyőzési stratégiák az Ars medicában (1577k.) [Strategies of persuasion in Ars medica ca. (1577)]

2012. 03. 22. 4th International Conference on Corpus Linguistics, Jaén (Spanyolország)
Strategies of persuasion in a 16th century remedy book

6.2. Publications

2015
A tetszikelés szociokulturális értéke. A tetszikelő kapcsolattartási stílus szerepe az orvos-beteg kommunikációban. [Socio-cultural values of a form of address: The role of tetszik in doctor/patient communication] Magyar Nyelvőr 139/1: 39–63. (with Domonkosi Ágnes)

2014


2013


2012


Forthcoming

6.3. Other publications

2015


2014

2010
Interview about names of illnesses (A „kijáró béltől” az aranyérig)
(http://www.hazipatika.com/articles/A_kijaro_beltol_az_aranyerig?aid=20100617124339)